

Andrew Moravcsik
Princeton University
June 2014

EXAMPLE OF AN ACTIVE CITATION

THE MAIN TEXT

In this quasi-academic example from the recent Steven Spielberg film *Lincoln*, the abolitionist Representative Thaddeus Stevens (played by Tommy Lee Jones) returns home to his mulatto common-law wife after the House of Representatives has passed the Thirteenth Amendment banning slavery. Referring to Lincoln's role in the episode, he utters the following striking phrase: "The greatest measure of the nineteenth century was passed by corruption, aided and abetted by the purest man in America." The historically-inclined may wonder: did Stevens actually say this, and if so, did he actually say it (only) at home to his companion? This precise question has been posed by Harold Holzer, Chairman of the Lincoln Bicentennial Foundation and consultant to the film, and he answers it as follows: "He may not have pronounced those words to his housekeeper, but pronounce them he absolutely did."¹ Others reject this view.² To access an active citation on this issue, click on footnote 3 below or, in hard copy, turn to Appendix I.³ This example illustrates why all three types of research transparency are critical. A balanced judgment about what may actually have happened in 1865 turns the selection of this particular source (procedure), the verbatim text in that source (data), and the interpretation of that text in historical, textual and cultural context (analysis). Active citation permits readers to decide for themselves if Spielberg's historical reconstruction is accurate.

¹ Henry Holzer, "What is true and false in the "Lincoln"," *The Daily Beast* (11.22.12),

<http://www.thedailybeast.com/articles/2012/11/22/what-s-true-and-false-in-lincoln-movie.html>

² Prof. Jay Case, "What Thaddeus Stevens Did Not Say About Abraham Lincoln," (4 March 2013). Accessed 12 June 2013. <http://www.jaycase.com/2013/03/04/what-thaddeus-stevens-did-not-say-about-abraham-lincoln/>

³ James Scovel, "Thaddeus Stevens," *Lippincott's Monthly Magazine* (April 1898), pp. 548-550.

TRANSPARENCY APPENDIX

NUMBER 1

ANNOTATION:

The first published reference to the “added and abetted” quotation appeared in 1898 by James M. Scovel (1831-1904). At the time of writing, Scovel was a retired New Jersey politician and lawyer making a living as an evangelist and a popular writer/lecturer on Lincoln and his times. Is he reliable on this point? On the positive side, Scovel’s account contains period details, including a story Stevens purportedly told him about the passage of the 15th Amendment, an anecdote about witnessing Stevens gamble, and a plausible explanation for Stevens’ concern about corruption, namely that Lincoln had traded away support for a direct railway line from Washington to New York to secure the 13th Amendment—an matter that would have been of interest to both Scovel of New Jersey and Stevens of Pennsylvania. In 1865 and 1866, Scovel supported Stevens’ position on black suffrage and the 14th and 15th Amendments, while Stevens supported Scovel’s aspirations to serve in Congress. They had some correspondence. (Thaddeus Stevens, *The Selected Papers of Thaddeus Stevens*, Volume 2, ed. Beverly Wilson and Holly Ochoa (University of Pittsburgh Digital Research Library, 2011), p. 304n; James M. Scovel, *Three Speeches Delivered in...New Jersey* (Camden: Horace Dick, 1870, p. 9; James M. Scovel, “Personal Recollections of Lincoln,” *The National Magazine* 17 (1903), pp. 698-699.) On the skeptical side, Scovel did not publish this recollection until 1898, at the age of 65, after having been driven out of politics and retired from law. He was at best only an intermittent eyewitness: during the Lincoln Administration, he appears only rarely to have visited Washington. Even afterwards, the correspondence suggests that Scovel was little more than a distant political ally of Stevens, though he held an influential position in New Jersey—an important swing state that helped elect Lincoln. In any case, Scovel’s account neither draws a connection between the quotation and Lydia Smith, nor suggests any reason for Scovel to have known if Stevens had said it to her in private. Some historians accept the quotation.

EXCERPT:

To the writer of this sketch Mr. Stevens told the story of the legislation which gave to the black man his right to vote: ... [548]

His favorite amusement was...to spend the evening at Hall and Pemberton's Faro Bank...and over canvas-back and Veuve Clicquot champagne woo unmolested the goddess of fortune....Stevens was never a heavy player, although I have seen him win fourteen hundred dollars on a twenty-dollar gold-piece as his only stake... [549]

Influence from the White House secured votes against a favorite measure of Mr. Stevens for an air-line railway from Washington to New York, and...these same votes helped Mr. Lincoln's great amendment for emancipation. Of this legislative bargain Stevens said, “The greatest measure of the nineteenth century was passed by corruption, aided and abetted by the purest man in America.”

During the last thirty years of his life its unwritten romance was the unselfish and tender devotion with which Stevens was attended by Lydia Smith, a mulatto, who in her youth had great beauty of person. [550]

CITATION:

James Scovel, "Thaddeus Stevens," *Lippincott's Monthly Magazine* (April 1898), pp. 548-550.

LINK: http://books.google.com/books?id=h_AzAQAAMAAJ&pg=PA550

SCANS:

To the writer of this sketch Mr. Stevens told the story of the legislation which gave to the black man his right to vote :

"The Sherman bill, as it was called, had passed the Senate after many days and nights of stubborn contest. Charles Sumner came to my house on Capitol Hill at three o'clock in the morning ; he was in a white heat, having wrapped his martial cloak about him in disgust, preferring not to remain and witness what he called the infamy of the Sherman bill, which put the reconstructed States *in statu quo ante bellum*, with the franchise just where it was before the war. John Forney, in his 'two papers, both daily,' had heralded the Sherman bill, which we thought was intended to make Sherman President in 1868, as a measure which 'brought light out of darkness.' Sumner came to consult me about defeating the Sherman bill in the House. It was late in the winter of 1866. I wanted the bill beaten as badly as Sumner did. I promised to beat it, but a majority of the Senate were for the bill, hailing it as a measure of pacification, and it was the biggest job I ever undertook in the House. I went to Sawyer, of Wisconsin, a rich

p. 548

the king must be amused,—and he was the king. His favorite amusement was, after supper at his own modest mansion to the east of the Capitol, to spend the evening at Hall and Pemberton's Faro Bank on Pennsylvania Avenue. Here was common ground, where the warring, jarring factions North and South could meet and over canvas-back and Veuve Clicquot champagne woo unmolested the goddess of fortune. There were no clubs in the Washington of 1856-60 except the gaming-houses. Stevens was never a heavy player, although I have seen him win fourteen hundred dollars on a twenty-dollar gold-piece as his only stake. On one occasion he had been playing in what he called hard luck. Mr. Martin, from Ohio, the reading clerk of the House, always at his elbow, and ready for a "sleeper" or a stake, repeatedly urged Stevens "to put a stack on the ace," which had lost three times. "I will stake my reputation," said Martin, "that the ace wins." With a doubting glance at Martin, Stevens shoved a stack of blue chips, worth fifty dollars, over to the ace, playing it to win, on Martin's judgment. The ace lost. Without the semblance of a smile the old statesman said, "Martin, you owe me a quarter." This was the value he put on Martin's "reputation."

p. 549

Influence from the White House secured votes against a favorite measure of Mr. Stevens for an air-line railway from Washington to New York, and, as the Rialto of Congress "hath its merchandise," these same votes helped Mr. Lincoln's great amendment for emancipation. Of this legislative bargain Stevens said, "The greatest measure of the nineteenth century was passed by corruption, aided and abetted by the purest man in America."

During the last thirty years of his life its unwritten romance was the unselfish and tender devotion with which Stevens was attended by Lydia Smith, a mulatto, who in her youth had great beauty of person. Her fidelity to his interests ended only with his death. He left her five thousand dollars in his will, but she had improved her opportunities and by prudent investments in Washington real estate amassed a considerable fortune. She purchased Stevens's old home in Lancaster, a two-story brick house, in which he lived till his constituents, grateful for his fidelity, returned him to Congress in 1859.