

Appendix D

Acknowledgments

D

OTA thanks the members of the advisory panel, workshop participants, contractors, and the many individuals and organizations that supplied information for this report. In addition, OTA acknowledges the following individuals for their review of drafts for OTA's study of the Human Genome Project and patenting DNA sequences:

Reid G. Adler
Morrison and Foerster
Washington, DC

Donald R. Baldwin
University of Washington
Seattle, WA

George J. Annas
Boston University Schools of Medicine
and Public Health
Boston, MA

Zbigniew Bankowski
World Health Organization
Geneva, Switzerland

Michael J. Astrue
Biogen
Cambridge, MA

Hugo A. Barrera Saldana
Facultad de Medicina, U.A.N.L.
Monterrey, Mexico

Ludwig Baeumer
World Intellectual Property Organization
Geneva, Switzerland

David Beier
Genentech
Washington, DC

Hollie L. Baker
Hale and Dorr
Washington, DC

Stephen A. Bent
Foley and Lardner
Washington, DC

Usha R. Balakrishnan
University of Iowa Research Foundation
Iowa City, IA

Paul Berg
Stanford University Medical Center
Stanford, CA

114 | Federal Technology Transfer and the Human Genome Project

Richard E. Bizley
Hepworth, Lawrence, Bryer and Bizley
Harlow, United Kingdom

Susan E. Cullen
Washington University
St. Louis, MO

Joyce Brinton
Harvard University
Cambridge, MA

Michele D'Urso
International Institute of Genetics and Biophysics
Naples, Italy

Baruch A. Brody
Baylor College of Medicine
Houston, TX

Manette Dennis
Ostrolenk, Faber, Gerb and Soffen
New York, NY

Paula Bruening
Office of Technology Assessment
Washington, DC

Hartmut Deyda
Federal Ministry of Research and Technology
Bonn, Germany

Douglas D. Busch
The Salk Institute for Biological Studies
San Diego, CA

Walter Doerfler
University of Cologne
Köln, Germany

C. Thomas Caskey
Merck
West Point, PA

Daniel Drell
U.S. Department of Energy
Germantown, MD

Jean-Jacques Cassiman
University of Leuven/Campus Gasthuisberg
Leuven, Belgium

Rebecca S. Dresser
Case Western Reserve University School of Law
Cleveland, OH

Aravinda Chakravarti
Case Western Reserve University
Cleveland, OH

Roseanne Dutton
University of Southern California
Los Angeles, CA

Ellen Wright Clayton
Vanderbilt University School of Law
Nashville, TN

William A. Eklund
Los Alamos National Laboratory
Los Alamos, NM

Michel Cohen-Solal
Groupement de Recherches et d'Etudes sur les
Genomes
Gif-sur-Yvette Cedex, France

Gary B. Ellis
Silver Spring, MD

Diane W. Cox
University of Toronto
Toronto, Canada

Octavio Espinosa
World Intellectual Property Organization
Geneva, Switzerland

S.S. Fluss
Geneva, Switzerland

Brenda D. Gavin
S.R. One, Limited
Wayne, PA

Keith I. Gibson
Human Genome Mapping Project Resource Centre
Harrow Middlesex, United Kingdom

David Givol
National Cancer Institute
National Institutes of Health
Bethesda, MD

Alan Goldhammer
Biotechnology Industry Organization
Washington, DC

Christian Gugerell
European Patent Office
Munich, Germany

Janis E. Haerer
FONET
Clearwater, FL

Albert P. Halluin
Pennie and Edmonds
Menlo Park, CA

Huw G. Hallybone
Carpmaels and Ransford
London, United Kingdom

Kathi E. Hanna
Churchton, MD

William A. Haseltine
Human Genome Sciences
Rockville, MD

Karen Hersey
Massachusetts Institute of Technology
Cambridge, MA

Marie Hirtle
World Health Organization
Geneva, Switzerland

Neil A. Holtzman
The Johns Hopkins Medical Institutions
Baltimore, MD

Alfredo Ilardi
World Intellectual Property Organization
Geneva, Switzerland

Diane Isonaka
Darwin Molecular
Bothell, WA

Rollin B. Johnson
Harvard University
Cambridge, MA

Bartha Maria Knoppers
University of Montreal
Montreal, Canada

Katherine Ku
Stanford University
Palo Alto, CA

Jeffrey P. Kushan
U.S. Patent and Trademark Office
Washington, DC

Betty Wolder Levin
Brooklyn College, CUNY
Brooklyn, NY

Darryl Macer
University of Tsukuba
Tsukuba, Japan

116 | Federal Technology Transfer and the Human Genome Project

Tom Major
University of Utah
Salt Lake City, UT

Lisa Raines
Genzyme
Washington, DC

Paul R. Martin
Lawrence Berkeley Laboratory
Berkeley, CA

Sir Dai Rees
Medical Research Council
London, United Kingdom

James Martinell
U.S. Patent and Trademark Office
Washington, DC

Philip R. Reilly
Shriver Center for Mental Retardation
Waltham, MA

Kenichi Matsubara
Osaka University
Osaka, Japan

Lee W. Rivers
National Technology Transfer Center
Wheeling, WV

Victor A. McKusick
The Johns Hopkins University
Baltimore, MD

Marcia L. Rorke
Mohawk Research
Rockville, MD

Kate H. Murashige
Morrison and Foerster
Washington, DC

Patricia Schreck
SmithKline Beecham
King of Prussia, PA

Sergio D.J. Pena
Latin American Program for the Human Genome
Belo Horizonte, Brazil

Randy Scott
Incyte
Palo Alto, CA

Alain Pompidou
Scientific Counselor of the Prime Minister
Paris, France

William K. Seltzer
University of Colorado School of Medicine
Denver, CO

Alfred Poulos
Women's and Children's Hospital
North Adelaide, Australia

Bennett M. Shapiro
Merck Research Laboratories
Rahway, NJ

Issac Rabino
Empire State College, SUNY
New York, NY

David Shapiro
The Nuffield Foundation
London, United Kingdom

Martin Rachmeler
University of California, San Diego
La Jolla, CA

Jay M. Short
Stratagene
La Jolla, CA

Alan E. Smith
Genzyme
Framingham, MA

James Sommercorn
Oncogenetics
Phoenix, AZ

Louis G. Tornatzky
Southern Technology Council
Research Triangle Park, NC

Albert Tramposch
World Intellectual Property Organization
Geneva, Switzerland

David Trickett
Fairfax, VA

Charles E. Van Horn
U.S. Patent and Trademark Office
Washington, DC

Dominique Vandergheynst
Commission of the European Communities
Brussels, Belgium

Gerald F. Vovis
Collaborative Research
Waltham, MA

James A. Wachta
Rackemann, Sawyer and Brewster
Boston, MA

Charles F. Warren
U.S. Patent and Trademark Office
Washington, DC

Thomas G. Wiggins
Cytotherapeutics
Providence, RI

Claude Wolff
Embassy of France
Washington, DC

Mariana Wolfner
Cornell University
Ithaca, NY

Michael S. Yesley
Los Alamos National Laboratory
Los Alamos, NM

Donald E. Yorde
Medical College of Wisconsin
Milwaukee, WI

WORKSHOP PARTICIPANTS

**Commercial Biotechnology and Patenting Human DNA Sequences
January 7, 1994**

Marilyn Hartig, *Workshop Chair*
Bristol-Myers Squibb
Princeton, NJ

Randy Scott
Incyte
Palo Alto, CA

David Beier
Genentech
Washington, DC

Bennett Shapiro
Merck
Rahway, NJ

Robert M. Cook-Deegan
National Academy of Sciences
Washington, DC

James Sommercorn
Oncogenetics
Phoenix, AZ

David Galas
Darwin Molecular
Bothell, WA

Timothy J. Gaul
Bristol-Myers Squibb
Princeton, NJ

Jay George
Oncor Med
Gaithersburg, MD

Gerald F. Vovis
Collaborative Research
Waltham, MA

William Haseltine
Human Genome Sciences
Rockville, MD

Gerald M. Walsh
Biocryst
Birmingham, AL

Patricia Schreck
SmithKline Beecham
King of Prussia, PA

Note: OTA appreciates and is grateful for the valuable assistance provided by the workshop participants. The workshop participants do not, however, necessarily approve, disapprove, or endorse this report. OTA assumes full responsibility for the report and the accuracy of its contents.

Index

A

Access to care, 76, 163-164
Access to information, 125-127, 130-132, 207-211
Access to records, 115
Administrative activities, 83
 providers, 83-84
 providers and payers, 84-87
Administrative simplification, 31-32, 80-83
Advanced Research Projects Agency, 170
Agency for Health Care Policy and Research, 72, 73, 127, 129, 131, 154, 157, 188, 203
AHCPR. *See* Agency for Health Care Policy and Research
AHSC. *See* American Hospital Supply Corp.
AITN. *See* Arizona-International Telemedicine Network
AMA. *See* American Medical Association
American Hospital Supply Corp., 93
American Medical Association, 155, 156, 157
American Self-Help Clearinghouse, 25
American Society for Testing and Materials, 68, 138
American Telemedicine Association, 179, 187
Analytic Systems Automated Purchasing, 93
ANSI, 68
ANSI X12, 69
Arizona-International Telemedicine Network, 173
ARPA. *See* Advanced Research Projects Agency
Artificial neural networks, 51-52
ASAP. *See* Analytic Systems Automated Purchasing
ASTM. *See* American Society for Testing and Materials
Australia, telemedicine, 176-177
Authentication, 116
Automated data collection, 46, 50-51

B

Brigham and Women's Hospital, 46

C

Canada, telemedicine, 176
CancerNet, 131
Cards, 55, 99-100
CBA. *See* cost-benefit analysis
CDC. *See* Centers for Disease Control and Prevention
CD-ROMs, 131
CEA. *See* cost-effectiveness analysis
Centers for Disease Control and Prevention, 73, 103
CHESS. *See* Comprehensive Health Enhancement Support System
CHI. *See* Consumer health informatics
CHIN. *See* Community Health Information Network
CHMIS. *See* Community Health Management Information System
Claims inquiry, 87
Claims services, 91
Claims submission, 86
Client-server architecture, 66-67
Clinical decision support, 52-54, 124-142, 197-200
 applications of, 197-200
 effectiveness and safety, 138-140, 153-155
 evaluation, 140-142
 information content, 136-138
 standards, 136-138, 155-158
 technology development, 135-136
Clinical information systems, 35-38
Clinical literature, 126
Clinical practice guidelines, 127-129
Clinical practice improvement, 134
Clinical protocols, 127-129, 133-134
Clinical research, 126
Clinical Telemedicine Cooperative Group, 179, 181, 203
Cochrane Collaboration, 131
Communications primer, 63-65
Community Health Information Network, 16, 63, 95-96, 108-109

Community Health Management Information System, 16, 95-96
 Community networking, 26, 95-103
 Community Services Network, 26
 COMPASS, 172
 Comprehensive Health Enhancement Support System, 25, 174
 ComputerLink, 25
 Computer software, 67-68
 Confidentiality, 114-118, 183
 Congressional interest, 9
 Connect System, 25, 175
 Consumer health informatics, 24-26
 Consumer information sources, 208
 Continuous quality improvement, 134, 144
 Coordination, 78
 Cost containment, 11-13
 Cost-benefit analysis, 12-13
 Cost-effectiveness analysis, 12-13
 Cost management, 5-6
 Cost reduction, 16, 75
 CPT-4, 155, 156, 157
 CQI. *See* Continuous quality improvement

D

Databases, 42
 Data distillation, 49-54
 Data security, 115-118, 183
 Data sets, maximum, 120
 Decision support system. *See* Clinical decision support
 Demand management system, 24, 65
 DEMPAQ. *See* Developing and Evaluating Methods to Promote Ambulatory Care Quality
 Department of Commerce, 203-204
 Department of Defense, 188, 189, 204
 Department of Health and Human Services, 9, 121, 159, 183, 202-203
 Department of Veterans Affairs, 179, 188, 190, 205
 Developing and Evaluating Methods to Promote Ambulatory Care Quality, 145, 154
 DHHS. *See* Department of Health and Human Services
 DICOM, 58
 Direct data entry, 87
 Dxpain, 139

E

East Carolina University School of Medicine, 170-171, 174
 EDI. *See* Electronic data interchange
 EDI standards. *See* Standards
 EFT. *See* Electronic funds transfer
 Electronic commerce, 79, 82

Electronic data interchange, 81-83, 87-95, 103-122
 cost savings, 104-109
 system costs, 103
 Electronic funds transfer, 92
 Electronic health information sources, 207-211
 Electronic house call, 168, 173-175
 Electronic order entry, 93
 Electronic publishing, 132
 Electronic signatures, 114
 Eligibility, 87
 Encounter reports, 87
 Encryption, 116
 Enrollment, 87
 Enterprise information systems, 35
 Enterprise networks, 102-103
 EOE. *See* electronic order entry
 Evidence-based medicine, 131
 Expert systems, 52-54, 132-133

F

FDA. *See* Food and Drug Administration
 Fee-for-service plan, 81, 143
 Financial institutions, 92-93
 Food and Drug Administration, 67-68, 76, 141, 154
 Forms, standardized, 93

G

General Accounting Office (GAO), 108
 Grassroots computer networking, 26-27

H

Handwriting recognition, 46-47
 Harvard Community Health Plan, 174
 HCFA. *See* Health Care Financing Administration
 Health care expenditures, 5-6
 Health Care Financing Administration, 13, 17, 19, 36, 87, 90, 104, 110, 112, 119, 121, 145, 154, 155, 157, 171, 177, 178, 188, 191, 202-203
 Health care reform, 6
 Healthcare Open Systems and Trials consortium, 72
 Health Evaluation through Logical Processing System, 52-54, 133, 137
 Health Informatics Standards Planning Panel, 72
 Health information, life cycle, 34-42
 Health information, regulatory environment for, 112-115, 121
 Health information sources, electronic, 207-211
 Health maintenance organization, 8, 81
 Health Plan Employer Data and Information Set, 145-147, 154
 HEDIS. *See* Health Plan Employer Data and Information Set
 HELP system. *See* Health Evaluation through Logical Processing system

High-Performance Computing and Communications Program, 73, 179, 203
 HISPP. *See* Health Informatics Standards Planning Panel
 HL7 standard, 70, 84
 HMO. *See* Health Maintenance Organization
 Hospital information systems, 37
 HOST. *See* Healthcare Open Systems and Trials consortium
 HPCC. *See* High-Performance Computing and Communications Program

I

ICD-9-CM standard, 70, 107, 156, 157
 Identifiers, 111-112, 120-121
 IITF. *See* Information Infrastructure Task Force
 Iliad, 139
 Imaging systems, 41
 compression, 56-58
 techniques, 55
 IMSystem, 146-149
 Indian Health Service, 159
 Industry fragmentation, 109-110
 Information Infrastructure Task Force, 8, 25, 62, 160, 181, 188, 189, 201
 Information needs, complexity of, 110
 Information Network for Public Health Officials, 103
 Information sources, electronic, 207-211
 Information technologies, 29-78
 adoption levels, 2, 3
 challenges and opportunities, 2
 compression, 54-58
 data distillation, 49-54
 data security, 60-62
 display and retrieval, 58-60
 distributed computing, 66-68
 high-bandwidth communications, 62-66
 object-oriented software, 67-68
 storage, 54-58
 INPHO. *See* Information Network for Public Health Officials
 Integrated delivery system, 84
 Integration of health services, 6, 8
 Internet, 63, 207-211
 Islands of automation, 1, 30-34

J

Job roles. *See* Workforce effects
 Joint Commission on Accreditation of Healthcare Organizations (JCAHO), 38, 146, 184

K

Kansas University Medical Center, 168-170
 Knowledge-based systems, 52-54, 132-133

L

LDS Hospital, 129, 133
 Legacy systems, 35
 Legislative activities, 9-10, 122, 160, 187, 188
 Lewin-VHI, 104
 Liability, physician, 184
 Licensing, physician, 183-184
 Little, Arthur D., Inc., 104

M

Managed care, 6, 7, 81, 143
 Mayo Clinic, 170
 MDIS. *See* Medical Diagnostic Imaging Support
 Medicaid, 8, 87, 154, 155, 177
 Medical College of Georgia, 166-168
 Medical Diagnostic Imaging Support, 204
 Medical informatics, 30
 Medical Information Bus, 50-51
 Medical logic modules, 137
 Medicare, 8, 87, 112, 114, 121, 154, 155, 177
 Medicare Transaction System, 110, 112
 Meditel, 139
 MEDLINE, 130
 MIB. *See* Medical Information Bus
 MTS. *See* Medicare Transaction System

N

NACHA. *See* National Automated Clearing House Association
 NASA. *See* National Aeronautics and Space Administration
 National Aeronautics and Space Administration, 73, 159, 170, 189, 204-205
 National Automated Clearing House Association, 92
 National Center for Health Services Research, 153, 154
 National Committee for Quality Assurance, 145
 National Committee on Vital and Health Statistics, 156, 157, 158
 National Consortium for Telemedicine Evaluation, 179-180
 National Council for Prescription Drug Programs, 69, 76, 95
 National Information Infrastructure, 8, 103, 160, 181, 188, 201
 National Information Infrastructure Testbed, 188, 189
 National Institutes of Health, 73

National Library of Medicine, 72, 131, 137, 153, 155, 157, 158, 159, 179, 188, 190, 203
 National Networks of Libraries of Medicine, 130
 National provider file, 112
 National Provider Identifier, 112, 121
 National Science Foundation, 73
 National Telecommunications and Information Administration, 171, 203-204
 National Uniform Billing Committee, 93
 NCPDP. *See* National Council for Prescription Drug Programs
 NCQA. *See* National Committee for Quality Assurance
 Networks, 79-122
 Neural networks, 51-52
 NIH. *See* National Institutes of Health
 NII. *See* National Information Infrastructure
 NLM. *See* National Library of Medicine
 Norway, telemedicine, 176
 NPI. *See* National Provider Identifier
 NSF. *See* National Science Foundation
 NUBC. *See* National Uniform Billing Committee

O

Office of Rural Health Policy, 171, 172, 179, 188, 190, 202
 OncoLink, 63, 131
 Optical character recognition (OCR), 42, 46
 Order entry, electronic, 93
 Oregon ED-NET, 172
 Organizational change, 3-4
 ORHP. *See* Office of Rural Health Policy

P

PACS. *See* Picture Archiving and Communications Systems
 Patient data management systems, 58-60
 Patient information, entering and retrieving, 129-132
 Patient information, limitations, 124-125
 Patient records
 computer-based, 41-42
 contents, 39
 paper-based, 38-41
 storage, 41
 weaknesses, 40-41
 Patients, information for, 208
 Pattern recognition, 49-51
 PDQ, 131
 Pen and quill laws, 4, 43
 Performance assessment, 142-152
 Performance Indicator Projects. *See* Report cards
 Personal digital assistants, 45
 Pharmaceutical benefit managers, 76

Pharmaceutical industry EDI, 94-95
 Picture Archiving and Communications Systems, 58, 173, 204
 Portable computers, 45
 Practice guidelines. *See* Clinical practice guidelines
 Practice management systems, 84
 Prisons, telemedicine, 175
 Privacy, 17, 114-118, 183
 Privacy Act, 117, 118
 Professional organizations and journals, 210
 Protocols. *See* Clinical protocols
 Provider assessment. *See* Performance assessment
 Providers, access to information, 125-127
 Public health networking, 103
 Public Health Service, 145
 Publication bias, 126

Q

QMR, 139
 Quality of care, 18-20, 123-158
 Clinical decision support, 124-142
 Performance assessment, 142-152

R

REACH-TV, 171
 Regenstrief Medical Record System, 36, 133
 Regional networking, 95-103
 Regulatory environment for health information, 112-115, 121
 Reimbursement, telemedicine, 177-178, 191
 Remittance advice, 86
 Report cards, 144-150
 RODEO NET, 171-172
 Rural area networks, 181-182
 Rural Utilities Service, 188, 203

S

Scope of the study, 10-11
 SCORPIO, 130
 Security. *See* Data security
 Shared decision support, 24
 SNOMED, 72
 Software, 67-68
 Space Technology Applied to Rural Papago
 Advanced Health Care, 159, 203, 204
 Speech recognition, 46-47
 Standards, 13-14, 17, 68-72, 77, 110-111, 136-138, 210
 DICOM, 58
 EDI, 88-89, 110-111, 119
 Forms, 93
 HL7, 70, 84
 ICD-9-CM, 70, 107, 156, 157
 Identifiers, 111-112, 120-121

- Messaging, 42, 68-69, 70, 72, 136
 - of care, 126
 - STARPAHC. *See* Space Technology Applied to Rural Papago Advanced Health Care
 - Structured data entry, 42
 - SUPPORT model, 139
- T**
- Tablet computers, 45
 - Telecommunications and Information Infrastructure Assistance Program, 203-204
 - Telemedicine, 20-23, 159-191, 209
 - Access, 163-164
 - Applications, 165-177
 - Costs, 161-163, 180
 - Development costs/financing, 185
 - Evaluation, 178, 179
 - Executive branch activities, 201-207
 - Government role, 188-191
 - Home-based, 173-175
 - Human infrastructure, 186
 - IITF subgroup on, 160, 189, 190-191, 201
 - Legal/regulatory, 181, 183-184
 - Other countries, 176-177
 - Other sites, 175-176
 - Potential effects, 160-165
 - Quality of care, 164-165
 - Research, 178-179, 190
 - Technology and implementation, 185-186
 - Telecommunications infrastructure, 179-180
 - Teleconsultations, 166-172
 - Teleradiology and telepathology, 172-173
 - Telemedicine Information Exchange, 190, 203
 - Texas Telemedicine Project, 168
 - Tiber Group, 104
 - TIE. *See* Telemedicine Information Exchange
 - TIIAP. *See* Telecommunications and Information Infrastructure Assistance Program
 - Tri-Service Telemedicine Testbed Project, 204
- U**
- Unified Medical Language System (UMLS), 72, 137, 155, 157
 - Urban telemedicine, 176
 - User interfaces, 99, 101
- V**
- Value-added network (VAN), 83, 92
- W**
- Wisconsin Health Information Network (WHIN), 63
 - Workforce effects, 4, 5
 - Workgroup for Electronic Data Interchange (WEDI), 93, 104, 116, 117
 - World Health Organization (WHO), 157
 - World Wide Web (WWW), 63, 207