Starpower: The U.S. and the International Quest for Fusion Energy

October 1987

NTIS order #PB88-128731



Recommended Citation:

U.S. Congress, Office of Technology Assessment, *Starpower:* The U.S. *and the Internna*tional *Quest for* Fusion *Energy*, OTA-E-338 (Washington, DC: U.S. Government Printing Office, October 1987).

Library of Congress Catalog Card Number 87-619854

For sale by the Superintendent of Documents U.S. Government Printing Office, Washington, DC 20402-9325 (order form can be found in the back of this report)

Foreword

Fusion research, offering the hope of an energy technology with an essentially unlimited supply of fuel and relatively attractive environmental impacts, has been conducted worldwide for over three decades. In the United States, increased budgetary pressures, along with a decreased sense of urgency, have sharpened the competition for funding between one research program and another and between energy research programs and other components of the Federal budget. This report, requested by the House Committee on Science, Space, and Technology and endorsed by the Senate Committee on Energy and Natural Resources, reviews the status of magnetic confinement fusion research and compares its progress with the requirements for development of a useful energy technology. The report does not analyze inertial confinement fusion research, which is overseen by the House and Senate Armed Services Committees.

OTA analyzed the magnetic fusion research program in three ways: (1) as an energy program, by identifying important features of the technology and discussing its possible role in the energy supply mix; (2) as a research program, by discussing its role in training scientists and developing new fields of science and technology; and (3) as an international program, by reviewing its history of international cooperation and its prospects for even more extensive collaboration in the future.

OTA could not have conducted this work without the valuable assistance it received from many organizations and individuals. In particular, we would like to thank the advisory panel members, workshop participants, and outside reviewers, who provided guidance and extensive critical reviews to ensure the accuracy of the report. Responsibility for the final report, however, rests solely with the Office of Technology Assessment.

John H .

JOHN H. GIBBONS Director

Magnetic Fusion Research Advisory Panel

William Carey, *Panel Chair* Executive Officer, American Association for the Advancement of Science

Ellen Berman Executive Director Consumer Energy Council of America

Linda Cohen Assistant Visiting Professor of Economics University of Washington

Paul Craig professor of Physics Department of Applied Science University of California, Davis

Harold Forsen Manger of Research and Development Bechtel National, Inc.

T. Kenneth Fowler Associate Director Magnetic Fusion Energy Lawrence Livermore National Laboratory

Melvin Gottlieb Director Emeritus Princeton Plasma Physics Laboratory

L. Charles Hebel Manager, Research Planning Corporate Research Technical Staff Xerox Corp.

Robert Hirsch Vice President Arco Oil & Gas Co.

Leonard Hyman Vice President Merrill Lynch Capital Markets Betty Jensen Nuclear and Environmental Program Manager Research and Development Public Service Electric & Gas Co.

Hans Landsberg Senior Fellow Emeritus Resources for the Future

Lawrence Lidsky Professor of Nuclear Engineering Massachusetts Institute of Technology

Irving Mintzer Senior Associate World Resources Institute

Robert park Executive Director Office of Public Affairs American Physical Society

Murray Rosenthal Associate Laboratory Director for Advanced Energy Systems Oak Ridge National Laboratory

Eugene Skolnikoff Director Center for International Studies Massachusetts Institute of Technology

Herbert Woodson Director Center for Energy Studies University of Texas, Austin

NOTE: OTA appreciates and is grateful for the valuable assistance and thoughtful critiques provided by the advisory panel members. The panel does not, however, necessarily approve, disapprove, or endorse this report. OTA assumes full responsibility for the report and the accuracy of its contents.

OTA Project Staff on Magnetic Fusion Research

Lionel S. Johns, Assistant Director, OTA Energy, Materials, and International Security Division

Peter D. Blair, Energy and Materials Program Manager

Gerald L. Epstein, Project Director

Dina K. Washburn

Contractors

Wilfrid Kohl Leonard Lynn Paul Josephson Lynn Powers Fusion Power Associates Battelle Pacific Northwest Laboratories

Administrative Staff

Lillian Chapman Linda Long Barbara J. Carter

Workshop Participants and Other Outside Reviewers

Workshop 1: Fusion Research

Panelists

Robert Seamans, *Workshop Chair* Senior Lecturer Aeronautics and Astronautics Department Massachusetts Institute of Technology

Sibley Burnett General Manager Applied Superconetics Division GA Technologies

Ronald Davidson Director Plasma Fusion Center Massachusetts Institute of Technology

Stephen Dean President Fusion Power Associates

Harold Forsen Manager of Research and Development Bechtel National, Inc.

T. Kenneth Fowler Associate Director Magnetic Fusion Energy Lawrence Livermore National Laboratory

Harold Furth Director Princeton Plasma Physics Laboratory

Melvin Gottlieb Director Emeritus Princeton Plasma Physics Laboratory

Robert Hirsch Vice President Arco Oil & Gas Co.

Robert Krakowski Group Leader Systems Study Group Los Alamos National Laboratory

Lawrence Lidsky Professor of Nuclear Engineering Massachusetts Institute of Technology Chuan Sheng Liu Chairman Department of Physics and Astronomy University of Maryland, College Park

Thomas Ratchford Associate Executive Officer American Association for the Advancement of Science

John Sheffield Associate Director for Confinement Fusion Energy Division Oak Ridge National Laboratory

Herbert Woodson Director Center for Energy Studies University of Texas, Austin

Contributor

N. Anne Davies Assistant Director Office of Fusion Energy U.S. Department of Energy

Workshop II: International Cooperation

Eugene Skolnikoff, *Workshop Chair* Director Center for International Studies Massachusetts Institute of Technology

Harold Benglesdorf Vice President International Group International Energy Associates Limited

Diana Bieliauskas Program Officer Office of Soviet and East European Affairs National Academy of Sciences

Justin Bloom President Technology International, Inc. Judy Bostock Operations Research Analyst U.S. Office of Management and Budget

Melvin Gottlieb Director Emeritus Princeton Plasma Physics Laboratory

Paul Huray Senior Policy Analyst General Science U.S. Office of Science and Technology Policy

Paul Josephson Program in Science, Technology and Society Massachusetts Institute of Technology

Wilfrid Kohl Director International Energy Program Johns Hopkins School of Advanced International Studies

Linda Lubrano Professor School of International Service The American University

Leonard Lynn Assistant Professor Department of Social and Decision Sciences Carnegie-Mellon University

Charles Newstead Foreign Affairs Officer Bureau of Oceans and International Environmental and Scientific Affairs U.S. Department of State

Douglas R. Norton Chief of International Planning and Program Office U.S. National Aeronautics and Space Administration

Herman Pollack Research Professor Department of International Affairs George Washington University Michael Roberts Director International Programs Office of Fusion Energy U.S. Department of Energy

Richard Samuels Professor of Political Science Massachusetts Institute of Technology

U. John Sakss Chief of International Program Support Office U.S. National Aeronautics and Space Administration

Workshop III: Energy Context

Robert Fri, *Workshop Chair* President Resources for the Future

Truman Anderson Director Program Planning and Analysis Oak Ridge National Laboratory

Charles Backus Assistant Dean College of Engineering and Applied Science Arizona State University

Charles Berg Professor and Head of Department Department of Mechanical Engineering Northeastern University

Jan Beyea Vice President of Science National Audubon Society

Paul Craig Professor of Physics Department of Applied Science University of California, Davis

Daniel Dreyfus Vice President Strategic Analysis and Energy Forecasting Gas Research Institute

James A. Edmonds Senior Research Economist Battelle Pacific Northwest Laboratories Harold Feiveson Center for Energy and Environmental Studies Princeton University

Bill Keepin School of Engineering and Applied Science Princeton University

Carlo La Porta Director of Research Solar Energy Industries Association

René Malès Senior Vice President and Principal Decision Focus, Inc.

Michael Mauel Assistant Professor Department of Applied Physics and Nuclear Engineering Columbia University

Irving Mintzer Senior Associate World Resources Institute

Eric Reichl Retired, Conoco Coal Corp.

Arthur Rosenfeld Director Center for Building Science Lawrence Berkeley Laboratory

John Siegel Vice President Atomic Industrial Forum

Don Steiner Institute Professor Department of Nuclear Engineering and Engineering Physics Rensselaer Polytechnic Institute

Other Outside Reviewers

Mohamed Abdou University of California, Los Angeles

Charles Baker Argonne National Laboratory

David Baldwin Lawrence Livermore National Laboratory Richard Barnes U.S. National Aeronautics and Space Administration

Lee Berry Oak Ridge National Laboratory

Joan Lisa Bromberg Laser History Project

Daniel Chavardes Embassy of France

Daniel Cohn Massachusetts Institute of Technology

Donald L. Cook Sandia National Laboratories

Tony Cox Embassy of the United Kingdom

John Deutch Massachusetts Institute of Technology

Thomas J. Fessenden Lawrence Berkeley Laboratory

Thomas G. Finn U.S. Department of Energy

William Hogan Lawrence Livermore National Laboratory

John Holdren University of California, Berkeley

Paul Koloc Phaser Corp.

Dennis Mahlum Battelle Pacific Northwest Laboratories

George Miley University Fusion Associates

David Overskei GA Technologies

John Richardson National Research Council

Marshall Rosenbluth University of Texas, Austin

Richard Rowberg Congressional Research Service

Mike Saltmarsh Oak Ridge National Laboratory

John Santarius F. Robert Scott Albert Teich University of Wisconsin, Madison Retired, Electric Power Research American Association for the Institute Advancement of Science Winfried Schmidt **Richard Siemons** Robert W. Turner Karlsruhe Nuclear Research Center Los Alamos National Laboratory U.S. Department of Defense Ken Schultz Joel Snow Wim Van Deelen U.S. Department of Energy European Communities Delegation GA Technologies