# *New Developments in Biotechnology:* Field-Testing Engineered Organisms: Genetic and Ecological Issues

May 1988

NTIS order #PB88-214101

# New **Developments in Biotechnology**







Field-Testing Engineered Organisms:

Genetic and Ecological Issues



### Recommended Citation:

U.S. Congress, Office of Technology Assessment, New Developments in Biotechnology-Field-Testing Engineered Organisms: Genetic and Ecological Issues, OTA-BA-350 (Washington, DC: U.S. Government Printing Office, May 1988).

Library of Congress Catalog Card Number 88-600522

For sale by the Superintendent of Documents U.S. Government Printing Office, Washington, DC 20402-9325 (order form can be found in the back of this report)

### Foreword

Since the discovery of recombinant DNA technology in the early 1970s much attention has focused on the potential benefits and risks presented by the new abilities of researchers to manipulate DNA. The importance of ecological issues was heightened in 1982 with the proposal by researchers to field test bacteria engineered to reduce crop losses due to frost damage. Additional pressures have come to bear as a result of developments in the economics of American agriculture and with foreign trade imbalances. In this special report OTA analyzes some of the scientific and public opinion issues surrounding the planned introduction of genetically engineered organisms into the environment.

The assessment of New *Developments in Biotechnology* was requested by the House Committee on Energy and Commerce and the House Committee on Science, Space, and Technology. The first publication in the series was *Ownership of Human Tissues and Cells*, and the second was *Public Perceptions of Biotechnology*. Subsequent studies will examine U.S. investment in biotechnology and issues relevant to the patenting of plants, animals, and microorganisms. This third report in the series illustrates a range of options for congressional action in three major areas of public policy related to this application of biotechnology:

- the criteria for review of planned introductions for potential risk,
- the administrative mechanisms for applying such review criteria, and
- the research base supporting planned introductions.

In gathering information for this study, OTA staff made site visits to the research facilities or proposed field test sites of seven companies developing engineered organisms for environmental applications or doing similar research. The site visits were made to California, Pennsylvania, Delaware, Missouri, Hawaii, and Wisconsin. Staff also attended and participated in numerous professional meetings devoted to scientific aspects of the issue.

OTA was assisted in preparing this study by a panel of advisors and reviewers selected for their expertise and diverse points of view on the issues covered in the assessment. Advisory panelists and reviewers were drawn from industry, academia, medicine, professional societies, environmental organizations, public interest groups, and Federal agencies. Written comments were received from 140 individuals on successive drafts of the report.

OTA gratefully acknowledges the contribution of each of these individuals. As with all OTA reports, the responsibility for content is OTA's alone.

JOHN H. GIBBONS

Director

# New Developments in Biotechnology Advisory Panel

Bernadine P. Healy, Panel *Chair* The Cleveland Clinic Foundation Cleveland. OH

Timothy B. Atkeson Steptoe & Johnson Washington, DC

**David Blumenthal** 

Brigham and Women's Hospital Corporation

Boston, MA

Hon. Edmund G. Brown, Jr.

Reavis & McGrath Los Angeles, CA

Nancy L. Buc

Weil, Gotshal & Manges

Washington, DC

Mark F. Cantley

Concertation Unit for Biotechnology in Europe

Brussels, Belgium

Alexander M. Capron

University of Southern California

Los Angeles, CA

Jerry D. Caulder Mycogen Corp. San Diego, CA

Lawrence I. Gilbert

The University of North Carolina

Chapel Hill, NC

Conrad A. Istock

The University of Arizona

Tucson, AZ

Edward L. Korwek Hogan and Hartson Washington, DC

Tsune Kosuge

University of California, Davis

Davis, CA

Richard Krasnow

Institute for International Education

Washington, DC

Sheldon Krimsky Tufts University Medford, MA

William E. Marshall

Pioneer Hi-Bred International, Inc.

Johnston, IA

Ronald L. Meeusen Rohm and Haas Co. Spring House, PA

Robert B. Nicholas

Nash, Railsback & Plesser

Washington, DC

Eric J. Stanbridge

University of California, Irvine

Irvine, CA

James M. Tiedje

Michigan State University

East Lansing, MI

Kunio Toriyama ZEN-NOH

Tokyo, Japan

Pablo D.T. Valenzuela

Chiron Corp. Emeryville, CA

Thomas E. Wagner Ohio University Athens, OH

NOTE: OTA appreciates and is grateful for the valuable assistance and thoughtful critiques provided by the advisory panel members. The panel does not, however, necessarily approve, disapprove, or endorse this report. OTA assumes full responsibility for the report and the accuracy of its contents.

# Field-Testing Engineered Organisms OTA Project Staff

Roger C. Herdman, Assistant Director, OTA Health and Life Sciences Division

Gretchen S. Kolsrud, Biological Applications Program Manager

Gary B. Ellis, Project Director

Robyn Y. Nishimi, *Analyst*Kevin W. O'Connor, *Analyst* 

### **Support Staff**

Sharon Kay Oatman, Administrative Assistant Linda S. Rayford, Secretary/Word Processing Specialist Barbara V. Ketchum, Clerical Assistant

#### Contractors

Linda Starke, *Editor*, Washington, DC Stephanie L. Forbes, *Editor*, Bowie, MD

David A. Andow, University of Minnesota, St. Paul, MN John M. Boyle, Louis Harris and Associates, Inc., Washington, DC William A. Check, Medical & Scientific Communications, Atlanta, GA Ellen W. Chu, Scientific & Technical Editing, Kirkland, WA David C. Coleman, University of Georgia, Athens, GA C.N. Dahm, University of New Mexico, Albuquerque, NM Andrew P. Dobson, University of Rochester, Rochester, NY James R. Gosz, University of New Mexico, Albuquerque, NM Fred Gould, North Carolina State University, Raleigh, NC Susan S. Hirano, University of Wisconsin, Madison, WI Robert E. Hodson, University of Georgia, Athens, GA Conrad A. Istock, University of Arizona, Tucson, AZ Kathleen H. Keeler, University of Nebraska, Lincoln, NE D. Matthew Knain, Louis Harris and Associates, Inc., Washington, DC Richard E. Lenski, University of California, Irvine, CA Bruce R. Levin, University of Massachusetts, Amherst, MA Simon A. Levin, Cornell University, Ithaca, NY Adrianne Massey, North Carolina State University, Raleigh, NC Elliott A. Norse, Washington, DC Stuart L. Pimm, University of Tennessee, Knoxville, TN Frances E. Sharples, Oak Ridge National Laboratory, TN S.S. Snapp, University of Minnesota, St. Paul, MN P.S. Teng, University of Minnesota, St. Paul, MN Christen D. Upper, University of Wisconsin, Madison, WI Gabor Vali, University of Wyoming, Laramie, WY

### Acknowledgment to Other OTA Staff

Robert Cook-Deegan, *Senior Associate*, Biological Applications Program Robert Friedman, *Senior Associate*, Oceans and Environment Program

# OTA/National Science Foundation Workshop Environmental Applications of Recombinant DNA Organisms: Genetic Issues, Nov. 21-22, 1985

David T. Kingsbury, Workshop *Chair*National Science Foundation
Washington, DC

Deb K. Chatterjee

**Environmental Protection Agency** 

Gulf Breeze, FL

Ron Chiarello IGB Products, Ltd. San Leandro, CA

Michael T. Clegg

University of California, Riverside

**James Collins** 

Arizona State University

Tempe, AZ

William R. Engels University of Wisconsin

Madison, WI

Patrick Flanagan

**National Science Foundation** 

Washington, DC

Garrett Hardin

University of California, Santa Barbara

Santa Barbara, CA

Philip Harriman

**National Science Foundation** 

Washington, DC

W. Frank Harris

**National Science Foundation** 

Washington, DC

**Bruce Levin** 

University of Massachusetts

Amherst, MA

Lois K. Miller

University of Georgia

Athens, ĞA

Stephen J. O'Brien

National Cancer Institute

Frederick, MD

Mark Obukowicz

Monsanto Company

St. Louis, MO

Philip Regal

University of Minnesota

Minneapolis, MN

James A. Shapiro

University of Chicago

Chicago, IL

James Tiedje

Michigan State University

East Lansing, MI

Richard G. Wiegart

University of Georgia

Athens, GA

NOTE: OTA appreciates and is grateful for the valuable assistance and thoughtful critiques provided by the workshop participants. The workshop participants do not, however, necessarily approve, disapprove, or endorse this report. OTA assumes full responsibility for the report and the accuracy of its contents.