Do Medicaid and Medicare Patients Sue More Often Than Other Patients?

September 1992

NTIS order #PB93-176972

DO MEDICAID AND MEDICARE PATIENTS SUE PHYSICIANS MORE OFTEN THAN OTHER PATIENTS?

BACKGROUND PAPER

Roger Herdman, Assistant Director, OTA Bealth and Life Sciences Division

Clyde J. Behney, Hnalth Pergram Manager

Judith L. Wagner, Project Director

Project Staff

Polly Ehrenhaft, Contractor

Other Contributing Staff

Jacqueline Corrigan, Senior Analyst Leah Wolfe, Analyst Philip Polishuk, Research Assistant

Administrative Staff

Marian Grochowski, Office Administrator Kimberly Hotenland, Wood Processing Specialist Eilen Musphy, P.C. Specialist Kelly Faulks, Secretary

DO MEDICAID AND MEDICARE PATIENTS SUE PHYSICIANS MORE OFTEN THAN OTHER PATIENTS?

BACKGROUND PAPER

Roger Herdman, Assistant Director, OTA Health and Life Sciences Division

Clyde J. Behney, Health Program Manager

Judith L. Wagner, Project Director

Project Staff

Pony Ehrenhaft, Contractor

Other Contributing Staff

Jacqueline Corrigan, Senior Analyst Leah Wolfe, Analyst Philip Polishuk, Research Assistant

Administrative Staff

Marian Grochowski, Office Administrator Kimberly Holmlund, Word Processing Specialist Eileen Murphy, P.C. Specialist Kelly Faulks, Secretary

Office of Technology Assessment Congressional Board of the 102d Congress

GEORGE E. BROWN, JR., California, *Chairman* TED STEVENS, *Alaska, Vice Chairman*

Senate

House

EDWARD M. KENNEDY Massachusetts JOHN D. DINGELL *Michigan*

ERNEST F. HOLLINGS South Carolina

CLARENCE E. MILLER Ohio

CLAIBORNE PELL Rhode Island DON SUNDQUIST Tennessee

ORRIN G. HATCH Utah AMO HOUGHTON New York

CHARLES E. GRASSLEY *lowa*

JOAN KELLY HORN *Missouri*

JOHN H. GIBBONS (Nonvoting)

Advisory Council

JOSHUA LEDERBERG, Chairman Professor Rockefeller University New York, New York MICHEL T. HALBOUTY
Chairman of the Board&
Chief Executive Officer
Michel T. Halbouty Energy Co.
Houston, Texas

CHASEN. PETERSON President Emeritus and Professor University of Utah Salt Lake City, Utah

NEIL E. HARL, Vice Chairman Professor Department of Economics Iowa State University Ames, Iowa JAMES C. HUNT Chancellor Health Sciences Center University of Tennessee Memphis, Tennessee JOSEPH E. ROSS

Director

Congressional Research. Service

The Library of Congress

Washington, D.C.

CHARLES A. BOWSHER Comptroller General of the United States Washington, D.C.

HENRY KOFFLER President Emeritus University of Arizona Tucson, Arizona JOHN F.M. SIMS Vice President, Marketing Usibelli Coal Mine, Inc. Fairbanks, Alaska

LEWIS M. BRANSCOMB
Director of Science, Technology &
Public Policy Program
Albert Pratt Public Service Professor
Harvard JFK School of Government
Cambridge, Massachusetts

MAX LENNON President Clemson University Clemson, South Carolina MARINA v.N. WHITMAN
Vice President & Group Executive
Public Affairs Staffs Group
General Motors Corporation
Detroit, Michigan

DirectorJOHN H. GIBBONS

The views expressed in this background paper are not necessarily those of the Board, OTA Advisory Council, or individual members thereof.

FOREWORD

Whether Medicaid and Medicare patients are likely to sue more or less often than other patients is a critical question in studying the recent trend of reduced physician participation in Medicaid and other publicly funded programs.

The Office of Technology Assessment addressed this issue as a part of its larger study on *Defensive Medicine and the Use of Medical Technology*. Denying medical access to patients whom physicians feel are more Litigious is defined as negative defensive medicine. This has become a particularly acute problem in the practice of obstetrics. The increased possibility of an adverse outcome, and therefore a potential lawsuit, as well as steeply rising malpractice insurance premiums is said to have driven physicians from the practice of obstetrics or significantly curtailed their volume of deliveries.

This background paper also responds to the request of the Congressional Sunbelt Caucus that OTA examine and judge the available evidence on whether Medicaid and Medicare patients, particularly obstetrics patients, are more litigious than other patients. Although the evidence is sparse, OTA's conclusions are strong: these patients are not more likely to sue and may actually sue less often than would be expected on the basis of their medical risks. A growing majority of obstetricians apparently agree with this assessment.

JOHN H. GIBBONS Director