New Developments in Biotechnology: Ownership of Human Tissues and Cells

March 1987

NTIS order #PB87-207536

New Developments in Biotechnology



Ownership of Human Tissues and Cells



Recommended Citation:

U.S. Congress, Office of Technology Assessment, New *Developments in Biotechnology: Ownership of Human Tissues and Cells—Special Report, OTA-BA-337* (Washington, DC: U.S. Government Printing Office, March *1987*).

Library of Congress Catalog Card Number 87-619804

For sale by the Superintendent of Documents U.S. Government Printing Office, Washington, DC 20402-9325

Foreword

In the 1960s, the term "biotechnology" did not exist. In the 1970s, development of techniques for: 1) splicing genetic information of one organism into that of another, and 2) fusing cells to produce large quantities of valuable proteins led to recognition that a revolution in biological technology—that is, biotechnology—was at hand. In the 1980s, biotechnology is best viewed as a growing cohort of technologies, each with its own scientific benefits and risks, and allied social, economic, legal, and ethical issues.

In this special report, OTA analyzes the economic, legal, and ethical rights of the human sources of tissues and cells and also those of the physicians or researchers who obtain and develop these biological materials. The study describes the potential of three rapidly moving technologies (tissue and cell culture, cell fusion to produce monoclinal antibodies, and recombinant DNA) for manipulating human tissues and cells to yield commercially valuable products. The report includes a range of options for congressional action related to commercialization of human biological materials, regulation of research with human subjects, and disclosure of physicians' commercial interest in patient treatment.

This special report is the first in a series of OTA studies being carried out under an assessment of "New Developments in Biotechnology." Forthcoming reports wrill include evaluations of: U.S. investment in biotechnology; public attitudes toward biotechnology; genetic and ecological issues in the environmental release of genetically engineered organisms; and the impact of intellectual property law on biotechnology. The assessment was requested by the House Committee on Science and Technology and the House Committee on Energy and Commerce.

OTA was assisted in preparing this study by an advisory panel, a workshop group, and reviewers selected for their expertise and diverse points of view on the issues covered in the report. OTA gratefully acknowledges the contribution of each of these individuals. As with all OTA reports, responsibility for the content of the special report is OTA alone. The special report does not necessarily constitute the consensus or endorsement of the advisory panel, the workshop group, or the Technology Assessment Board.

JOHN H. GIBBONS

Director

New Developments in Biotechnology Advisory Panel

Bernadine P. Healy, *Panel Chair*The Cleveland Clinic Foundation
Cleveland, OH

Timothy B. Atkeson Steptoe & Johnson Washington, DC

David Blumenthal

Brigham and Women's Hospital Corp.

Boston, MA

Hon. Edmund G. Brown, Jr.

Reavis & McGrath Los Angeles, CA

Nancy L. Buc

Weil, Gotshal & Manges

Washington, DC

Mark F. Cantley

Concertation Unit for Biotechnology in Europe

Brussels, Belgium

Alexander M. Capron

University of Southern California

Los Angeles, CA

Jerry D. Caulder Mycogen Corporation San Diego, CA

Lawrence I. Gilbert

The University of North Carolina

Chapel Hill, NC

Conrad A. Istock

The University of Arizona

Tucson, AZ

Edward L. Korwek Keller and Heckman Washington, DC

Tsune Kosuge

University of California, Davis

Davis. CA

Richard Krasnow

Resources for the Future

Washington, DC

Sheldon Krimsky Tufts University Medford, MA

Joshua Lederberg

The Rockefeller University

New York, NY

William E. Marshall

Pioneer Hi-Bred International, Inc.

Johnston, IA

Ronald L. Meeusen Rohm and Haas Company

Spring House, PA

Robert B. Nicholas Blum, Nash & Railsback

Washington, DC

Eric J. Stanbridge

University of California, Irvine

Irvine, CA

James M. Tiedje

Michigan State University

East Lansing, MI

Kunio Toriyama

ZEN-NOH

Tokyo, Japan Pablo D.T. Valenzuela Chiron Corporation

Emeryviile, CA

Thomas E. Wagner Ohio University

Athens, OH

Luther S. Williams

Atlanta University

Atlanta, GA

NOTE: OTA appreciates and is grateful for the valuable assistance and thoughtful critiques provided by the panel members.

The panel members do not, however, necessarily approve, disapprove, or endorse this report. OTA assumes full responsibility for the report and the accuracy of its contents.

Ownership of Human Tissues and Cells—OTA Project Staff

Roger C. Herdman, OTA Assistant Director Health and Life Sciences Division

Gretchen S. Kolsrud, Biological Applications Program Manager

Gary B. Ellis, Project Director

Gladys B. White, Study Director and Analyst

Lisa J. Raines, *Study Director* and *Legal Analyst*Robyn Y. Nishimi, *Analyst*Kevin W. O'Connor, *Legal Analyst*

Support Staff

Sharon Kay Oatman, Administrative Assistant
Linda S. Ray ford, Secretary/Word Processing Specialist
Barbara V. Ketchum, Clerical Assistant

Editor

Chris Elfring, Takoma Park, MD

Outside Contributors

James F. Childress, University of Virginia
Iver P. Cooper, Mackler, Cooper and Marx
Jeffrey N. Gibbs, Mackler, Cooper and Marx
Bruce G. Goodman, Damon Corporation
Warren Greenberg, George Washington University
Rosemary Gibson Kern, American Enterprise Institute
Patricia A. King, Georgetown University
Gilah Langner, ICF, Inc.
Robert J. Levine, Yale University
Mark J. Minasi, Moulton & Minasi
Thomas H. Murray, University of Texas Medical Branch, Galveston
Fay A. Rozovsky, Halifax, Nova Scotia
Emanuel Thorne, Washington, DC
Allen B. Wagner, Berkeley, CA

Acknowledgment to Other OTA Staff

Clyde J. Behney, *Health Program, Manager*R. Alta Charo, *Legal Analyst*Kathi E. Hanna, *Analyst*Jane E. Sisk, *Senior Associate*

¹Through May 1986.

New Developments in Biotechnology Working Group on Ownership of Human Tissues and Cells

LeRoy Walters, **Working Group Chair** Georgetown University Washington, DC

Thomas L. Beauchamp Georgetown University Washington, DC

Bruce G. Goodman Damon Corporation Needham Heights, MA

Geoffrey M. Karny Finnegan, Henderson, Farabow, Garrett and Dunner

Washington, DC

Patricia A. King Georgetown University Law Center

Washington, DC

Robert J. Levine Yale University School of Medicine

New Haven, ČT

Charles R. McCarthy National Institutes of Heallth Bethesda, MD Barbara Mishkin Hogan & Hartson Washington, DC

Thomas H. Murray

University of Texas Medical Branch

Galveston, TX

Joseph G. Perpich Meloy Laboratories, Inc.

Springfield, VA

Ivor Royston

University of California, San Diego

San Diego, CA

Herbert F. Schwartz Fish & Neave

New York, NY

Howard S. Schwartz Jewish General Hospital Montreal, Quebec

OTA is grateful for the valuable assistance and thoughtful critiques provided by the Working Group members. The views expressed in this OTA report, however, are the sole responsibility of the Office of Technology Assessment.