Index

Index

Key: t = table; f = figure; ph = photoAbandonment law of conversion and trespass to chattel, 82 Access to human biological materials interested parties, 49-64 Accession law source of rights relating to human biological materials, 83-84, 87 Adrenalin crystals patentable, 71 Aging, human study with primary cell cultures, 33 Agricultural doctrine applicability to cases involving human biological materials, 83-84, 85 Alabama commercial code implied warranties in sales of human blood and tissues, 77 tax on blood sales, 78 American Law Institute on wrongful acts toward cadavers, 73 Andrews, Lori B. on property rights to body parts, 127 Angiogenin commercialization, 60 research and development, 60, 61f Antibodies composition and structure, 37 monoclonal, 5, 37-38, 39f, 44, 62 polyclonal, 37 production and function, 5, 35, 37, 38 Autonomy libertarian view of justice, 135-136 Autopsies Law and religion, 72-75, 87, 139 Availability of human biological materials effect of commercialization, 116, 124-125, 135 equity, 12 **B** lymphocytes hybridomas, 38 immune response, 37 Battery law applicability to consent issues, 93-94, 110 Beneficence ethics of buying and selling bodies and their parts, 134-135 Bernard, Claude on research on biological materials, 29 Biopharmaceuticals commercial potential, 50-51 development and testing, 31, 58-59, 59t, 60, 61f, 154 estimated U.S. marketing dates, 58t licensing, 61 Biotechnology definition, 24 history and development, iii, 23

industry, 8, 52, 56-63, 119 issues, iii Biotherapeutics, Inc. fee-for-service research, 62 Blood and blood products donation, 52, 117-118, 141, 212 lymphokine content, 39-40 marketing, 12, 24, 76-78, 87, 117-118 ownership, 26 Bodies and their parts moral status, 130-134, 136, 137-144 Bone marrow, human collection and payment by the National Institutes of Health. 52 Brenner v. Manson Supreme Court decision on patentability, 71 Cadavers dissection, 140f emotional distress claims, 72-75 "Judeo-Christian tradition," 138-139, 141, 142 law, 72-75, 87 sources of human tissue, 7, 51 wrongful acts toward, 72-73 California law accession, 85-86 disposal of human biological materials, 80 Cancer cells fusion with T lymphocytes to produce hybridomas, 40 National Cancer Institute network, 53 Cancer treatment fee-for-service research, 62 Carcinogenesis use of cell fusion in research, 35 Cartesian philosophy moral status of bodies and their parts, 137-138, 142 Case histories angiogenin development, 60, 61f Chakrabarty-Patent and Trademark Office organism patentability case, 49 coerced tissue donation, 77 Hagiwara case, 4, 26 hypothetical case concerning effect of commercialization on doctor-patient relationship, 14 hypothetical case concerning proper transfer and use of human biological materials, 129 ownership of human cells, 24-26 Stanford University cell line ownership case, 25 University of California, Los Angeles-Hoffman-LaRoche cell line ownership case, 25-26 University of California, Los Angeles-Moore ownership case, 26 Catholicism moral status of bodies and their parts, 141-142 CCPA. See Court of Customs and Patent Appeals, U.S. Cell culture commercialization, 3, 4, 16-17, 116 development and technology, 5, 8, 25f, 31-35, 36f, 40, 44. 55-56

ownership, 3, 4, 17, 25 patentability, 49-50 repositories, 52-53 trade secrets, 78 transfers, 12, 52 use, 35, 116-117 Cell fusion development and use, iii, 35, 38 Cells, human applicability of cadaver law, 73 commercial interest, 7, 24, 49-51, 54, 56-62 emotional distress claims, 73-75 genetic content and engineering, 6, 41-42 ownership, 24-27, 69-87 repositories, 52-53 storage, 33 trade secrets, 79, 87 uses, 7, 52, 54-55 Cells, mammalian compared with microbial cells, 31t Chakrabarty-Patent and Trademark Office case patentability of organisms, 49, 50, 71 Christianity moral status of bodies and their parts, 138-139, 141-143 Cloned genes, human repositories, 52-53 uses, 34, 40, 44 Clonetics Corp. marketing of normal cloned human skin cells, 24 Commerce in human biological materials development of biotechnology products, 8, 50-51, 55-56, 60, 113, 119-121 effects on costs, 12-13, 116-117, 135 emotional distress claims, 74 equity of distribution, 116, 124-125 ethical considerations, 13-15, 127, 129-144 hypothetical case study, 14 informed consent, 17-19, 96 interest in research and inventions, 49-51, 56-62 legal considerations, 9, 50-51, 70, 72, 76-78, 83, 87 market system, 12, 119-121, 123-125, 134 physician/researcher and patient/subject relationship, principle of beneficence, 134-135 principles of justice, 135 role of Federal Government, 15-19 safety and quality, 117-118 Commissioners on Uniform State Laws Uniform Anatomical Gift Act, 75 Common law physician's fiduciary duty, 82-83 property rights in corpses, 72 relevance to use of human tissues and cells, 9, 69, 86-87 res nullius, 82 rights of sources of human biological materials, 80, 93-94,102,110-111 Compensation. See Payments

Confidentiality agreements, 78-79 Federal consent and disclosure regulations, 95, 100, 109-110 Congress effect of actions on sources of human tissue, 51 establishment of President's Commission for the Study of Ethical Problems in Medicine and Biomedical and Behavioral Research, 99 House Committee on Science and Technology, 50, 52 National Organ Transplant Act, 75-76 patent policy, 50, 70 policy on use of human biological materials, 15-19 Connecticut supreme court on disclosure, 99-100 Consent of source of human biological materials ethical considerations, 131, 134, 135-136, 142 legal considerations, 73, 74-75, 93-94 market system for human biological materials, 120 physicians' obligations and patients' rights, 14, 99 policy considerations, 10-11 requirements, 17-19, 93-111, 113, 129, 152-153 Scholendorff v. Society of New York Hospital, 91 Contract law relevance to human biological materials, 9, 17 Conversion law relevance to use of human biological materials, 79-83, 84-86, 87 Copyright law source of rights relating to human biological materials, 78.87 Corruption possibility in distribution of human biological materials, 116, 117 Court of Customs and Patent Appeals, U.S. Chakrabarty-Patent and Trademark Office organism patentability case, 49 In re Bergey decision, 49-50 Deoxyribonucleic acid. See DNA Department of Commerce, U.S. revised regulations, 50n Department of Health and Human Services, U.S. regulation of research, 10, 11, 17-18, 94-95, 96, 97, 106, 107, 147-154 Descartes. Rene development of view of mind-body duality, 137 Diamond v. Chakrabarty Supreme Court organism patentability decision, 49, 50, 71 Disclosure to source of human biological materials requirements, 10-11, 102, 104-106, 110-111 Scholendorff v. Society of New York Hospital, 91 DNA. See also Recombinant DNA composition and function, 41-42 copyrightability, 78 Dobson, Matthew experiment with human biological materials, 23

Dolnick, Edward on commercial potential of human cells, 113 Economic considerations biotechnology, 63 use of human biological materials, 11-13, 113, 115-125 Egalitarian view of justice ethics of buying and selling bodies and their parts, 136 Emotional distress caused by acquisition and use of human biological materials, 72-75 Employers' rights "hired to invent" doctrine, 70-71 Engelhardt, H. Tristram, Jr. principle of respect for persons, 133-134 Equity effects of commerce in human biological materials, 12, 13, 115-116, 124-125, 135-136 Ethical considerations use of human biological materials, 13-15, 127, 129-144 Families' rights cadavers, 72-75, 131 Federal Government interest in human biological materials, 7, 15-19, 50 support for National Disease Research Interchange, 123 Federal law and regulations blood and semen sales, 76 blood plasma as property, 78 conversion and trespass to chattel, 79 copyright, 78 human research, 10-11, 17-18, 94-95, 96, 97, 100, 102, 104-110, 147-154 ownership rights, 25 patents, 49, 50, 70-72, 87 personal rights, 70, 86 testing of biotechnology products, 61, 154 use of human tissues and cells in biotechnology, 17-18 Fee-for-service research interested parties, 62 patients' costs, 62 Financial gain from human biological materials disclosure of prospect to source of human biological materials, 10-11, 102, 104-106, 110-111 effect on voluntariness of consent, 96, 97 ethical distribution, 130 Federal Government's rights, 17 interested parties, 49-63 sources' rights, 16-17 Fletcher, Joseph on moral status of bodies and their parts, 132, 142 Food and Drug Administration, U.S. regulations of biological materials and human research, 10, 54, 60-61, 94, 95 For-profit institutions interaction with nonprofit institutions, 123-124 regulation, 122

Genentech development and ownership of KG-1 cell line, 25 **General Electric** organism patentability case, 49 Genes clones, 6, 40, 41-44, 45, 52 composition and function, 41-42 excision with restriction endonucleases, 42-43 expression. 42f probes, 16-17, 43-44 quantity in human cells, 41-42 use of monoclinal antibodies in research, 38 Genetic engineering. See Recombinant DNA Government interference in commercialization of human biological materials, 133-134, 135-136, 143 relationship with nonprofit institutions, 122-123 Growth hormone, human production and use, 45 Hagiwara hybridoma development and ownership dispute, 4, 26 Harvard University Medical School angiogenin research and development, 60 "Hired to invent" doctrine patent law, 70-71 Hoffman-LaRoche development and ownership of KG-1 cell line, 25-26 House Committee on Science and Technology survey of research use of human tissues and cells, 52 House Committee on Science and Technology Investigations and Oversight Subcommittee 1985 survey on patent applications, 50 HT-29 human tumor cell line angiogenin development, 60 Human rights egalitarian view of justice, 136 Hybridomas commercial product, 3 fee-for-service research, 62 ownership, 4, 26 technology, 5, 6, 35, 37-40, 44, 52 "Imago dei" doctrine moral status of bodies and their parts, 138, 139 Immunity higher animals, 35, 37 hybridoma technology, 35, 37-40 In re Bergey organism patentability, 49-50 Industry acquisition of human biological materials, 52 effects of 1980 patent law changes, 50-51 exploitation of biomedical research, 50 interest in human tissues and cells, 8, 56-62 payments to researchers and physicians, 61-62, 119 product development, 59t, 61 profits from government-funded research, 17 relationships with universities, 7, 54, 61-62, 119

transfers of human biological materials, 52 use of rodent monoclinal antibodies, 38 Informed consent. See Consent Injuries law of conversion and trespass to chattel, 81-82 rights relating to human biological materials, 69-70 "Innovation lag" in commercial exploitation of research congressional concern, 50 Institutional Review Boards approval of research, 17-18, 95, 96, 100, 102, 105, 109-110, 149-151 Insulin, human production and use, 45 Insurance ownership and use of human biological materials, 4, 27 Interagency Human Subjects Coordinating Committee regulation of human research, 94 Interferon occurrence in human blood, 39-40 production and therapeutic use, 6, 25-26, 40, 44, 45 Interleukin-2 therapeutic use, 40, 62 Inventions biological, 7, 24, 49-51, 63 inventors' rights, 16, 70-72, 87 legal definition, 71-72 Judaism moral status of bodies and their parts, 138-139, 141 "Judeo-Christian tradition' moral status of bodies and their parts, 138-139 Justice ethics of buying and selling bodies and their parts, 13-14, 15, 135-136 Kant, Immanuel on moral status of bodies and their parts, 142 Kass, Leon R. on control of biomedical research, 47 principle of respect for persons, 132-133 KG-1 cell line development and ownership, 25-26 Kidney procurement system corruption, 116 Kohler, Georges discovery of hybridoma production technique, 38 Legal considerations biotechnology, 63 injuries to persons versus injuries to property, 69-70 market for human biological materials, 124 ownership of human biological materials, 9, 24-27, 52 possible sources of rights relating to human biological materials, 70-84, 87 remedies, 84-86 use of human biological materials, 9, 69-87 Liabilitv blood and semen sales, 76-77 insurance, 27

specimen users, 4 tissue conversion cases, 86 trade secrets law, 78 Libertarian view of justice commercialization of human biological materials, 135 "Liver Tissue Procurement and Distribution System" establishment and purpose, 53 Lymphocytes immune response, 37 Lymphokines fee-for-service research, 62 function in immune response, 38-39 technology, 5, 37, 38-40 therapeutic use, 40 Macrophages function in immune response, 38-39 McCormick, Richard on organ donations, 141 Medical Research Council's Laboratory of Molecular Biology discovery of hybridoma production technique, 38 Medical treatment consent and disclosure requirements, 93-100, 102, 104, 110-111 Mendel principles of genetics, 41 Micro-organisms as trade secrets, 78 ownership, 133 Milstein, Cesar discovery of hybridoma production technique, 38 "Mo" cell line development and ownership, 26 Monoclinal antibodies technology and use, 5, 37-38, 39f, 44, 62 Monsanto Co. angiogenin research and development, 60 Moore, John congressional testimony on patients' rights, 21 development and ownership of "Mo" cell line, 26 Morality. See Ethical considerations Murray, Thomas H. congressional testimony on sharing of profits from human biological materials with sources, 67 on sale of body parts, 127 National Cancer Institute development and ownership of KG-1 cell line, 25 establishment of cancer tissue network, 53 experimental cancer treatments, 62 National Disease Research Interchange establishment and operations, 53, 123 National Institutes of Health collection of blood and bone marrow for research, 52 establishment of National Disease Research Interchange, 123 ownership dispute over WI-38 cell line, 25 patent policy, 50 regulation of human research, 94

support of human-related research, 52 support of repositories of human biological materials, 53 National Organ Transplant Act model for statute prohibiting buying and selling human tissues and cells, 16 regulation of human organ donation and sales, 3, 75-76 Negligence law applicability to consent issues, 94, 110 Nonmarket system development and production of human biological materials, 119-121, 125 Nonprofit organizations patenting federally funded inventions, 50 role in procurement and distribution of human biological materials, 13, 121-124, 125 Office of Technology Assessment "New Developments in Biotechnology " series, iii survey of Institutional Review Boards, 96 Oldham, R.K. foundation of Biotherapeutics, Inc., 62 Organ donations ethical considerations, 130, 131-132, 139, 141, 142, 143 law and regulations, 3, 75-76, 87 payments for, 75-76, 87, 118 Ostrach, Michael S. on documentation of consent, 113 Patent and Trademark Amendment Act patenting and licensing of products of governmentsponsored research, 7, 50 Patent and Trademark Office position on patentability of organisms, 49, 50 Patent law effect on transfers of human biological materials, 12, 50-51. 52 relevance to human biological materials, 7, 16-17, 24n, 49-50, 63, 70-72, 81, 87 Patients. See also Sources of human biological materials rights and interests, 7, 16-19, 21, 26, 51, 63, 71, 78-87, 93-111 Payments for human biological materials relation to value, 123-124 to physicians and researchers, 119 to sources, 12-13, 15-16, 55-56, 75-76, 100, 108, 115-121, 125, 141-142 Pearson v. Dodd applicability to subcultures from existing cell lines, 81 Pew Memorial Trust establishment of National Disease Research Interchange, 123 Pharmaceutical industry acquisition of human biological materials, 52, 55-56 effects of 1980 patent law changes, 50-51 interest in human tissues and cells, 56-62 payments to researchers and physicians, 119 research and development, 61 testing, 35, 54, 154

Philosophy moral status of bodies and their parts, 132-134, 137-138, 142, 143 Physicians acquisition of human biological materials, 52, 73-75 consulting relationships with biotechnology and disclosure requirements, 18-19, 93-111 fiduciary duty, 82-83, 97, 121 pharmaceutical companies, 119 relationship with patients, 14, 51, 97-98, 117, 129 Pituitary hormone preparations transmission of Creutzfeld-Jakob disease, 118 Pius XI on moral status of bodies and their parts, 141 Pius XII on compensation for organs and tissues, 141-142 Policy on human biological materials effect of religion on law and public opinion, 14, 138 issues and options for Congress, 15-19 President's Commission for the Study of Ethical Problems in Medicine and Biomedical and Behavioral Research study of informed consent, 99 "Product of nature" doctrine patentability of cell lines, 50 Profits. See Financial gain Property law relevance to use of human tissues and cells, 9 Property rights human biological materials, 24-27, 69-87, 127 Presser. William on wrongful acts toward cadavers, 72-73 Protection of Human Subjects (45 CFR Part 46) guidelines adequacy for regulation of use of human tissues and cells in biotechnology, 17-18 Protestantism moral status of bodies and their parts, 142-143 Public domain unregistered cell lines, 17 Ramsey, Paul principle of respect for persons, 131-132 Recombinant DNA copyrightability, 78 gene probe, 43-44 increased use of human specimens, 52

mechanism, 42-43 synonymous with genetic engineering, 41

technology, iii, 5-6, 35, 41-45

use with monoclinal antibody technology, 38

Religion

impact on use of human biological materials, 13-15, 138-144

Remedies

cases involving human biological materials, 84-86 Repositories

supplying human biological materials to researchers, 52-53

Res nullius law of conversion and trespass to chattel, 82-83 Research commercial interest, 3, 8, 49-51 consent and disclosure requirements, 93-98, 100-106, 110-111 emotional distress claims, 73-75 ethical considerations, 129-144 fee-for-service, 62 funding, 50, 63, 154 Judaism, 139, 141 patent law, 70-72, 87 purposes, 54 regulation, 10, 11, 17-19, 47, 107-108, 110-111, 149-154 use of human biological materials, 8, 54-55, 62-63 Research subjects. See also Sources of human biological materials interests, 51 legal dynamics of relationship with researchers, 97-98 not considered inventors, 71 payment, 62 rights, 16-19, 83, 93-111, 147-154 Researchers acquisition of human biological materials, 52 consulting relationships with biotechnology and pharmaceutical companies, 119 interests, 8, 52-56 relationship with sources of human tissue, 51, 97-98 responsibilities to subjects, 93-111 rights, 4, 12, 70-72, 83-84, 107, 115, 119, 130 transfers of human biological materials, 52 wrongful acts, 73-75 Respect for persons ethics of buying and selling human biological materials, 130-134 justice, 135-136 Protestantism, 142 Roche Institute of Molecular Biology development and ownership of KG-1 cell line, 25 Roman Catholicism moral status of bodies and their parts, 141-142

Scholendorff v. Society of New York Hospital

informed consent and disclosure, 91 Scientists. See Researchers Semen sales law, 76-77, 87 Silvestri v. Grant patentability decision, 71-72 Slavin, Ted marketing blood, 24 Sources of human biological materials. See also Research subjects; Patients basis of researchers' choices. 54 coercion of, 44, 77, 96-98, 109, 134-135 collection and compensation, 52 emotional distress claims, 73-75 identification, 4 interests, 51 not considered inventors, 71

payment, 12-13, 15-16, 55-56, 62, 75-76, 115-120, 124-125 rights, 4, 9, 16-17, 67, 70-84, 87, 119, 124, 130 Specification doctrine law of accession, 84 Stanford University ownership dispute over WI-38 cell line, 25 State law blood and semen sales, 76, 87 consent and disclosure requirements, 94, 95-96, 98-100, 104, 110-111 conversion and trespass to chattel, 79, 80, 85-86, 87 cultures and micro-organisms as trade secrets, 78 implied warranties in sales of human blood and semen, 77 organ donation, 75 personal rights, 69-70 tax on blood sales, 78, 87 Storage human cells, 33, 34ph Supply. See Availability Supreme Court, US. Brenner v. Manson patentability decision, 71 Diamond v. Chakrabarty organism patentability decision, 49, 50, 71 effect of actions on sources of human tissue, 51 1980 ruling on patentability of new life forms, 7 T cell hybridomas lymphokine production, 40 T lymphocytes function and use, 38-40 Tax law sale of blood, 78, 87 Tennessee Supreme Court tax on blood sales, 78 Theology use of human biological materials, 131-132, 138, 139, 142, 143 Thomasson, Mildrene C. on research use of human biological materials, 21 Tissue culture technology, 5, 31-55 Tissues, human applicability of cadaver law, 73 as property, 69-87 difficulty in establishing value, 116 donation. 139. 141 emotional distress claims, 73-75 House Committee on Science and Technology survey of research use, 49-56 industry interest, 56-62 reasons for removal, 51 relative rarity, 55-56 repositories, 52-53 sources, 7-8 sources' interests, 51 trade secrets, 79, 87 Tort law relevance to use of human biological materials, 9, 69, 70, 72-73, 87

Totality

moral status of bodies and their parts, 141 Trade secrets law source of rights relating to human biological materials, 78-79, 87 Transfer of human biological materials among researchers, 52 confidentiality agreements, 78-79 effect of payments to sources on equity, 116, 117 impact of religious traditions, 143 moral and ethical considerations, 15, 129, 143-144 organ donation law, 75, 87 ownership rights, 52 Trespass-to-chattel law source of rights relating to human biological materials, 79-83, 87 Undeveloped human biological materials distinct from biological inventions, 24 Uniform Anatomical Gift Act regulation of human organ donation, 3, 75 uniform Commercial Code applicability to blood and semen sales, 76-78, 87 Uniform Trade Secrets Act applicability to human tissues and cells, 79 Universities increased patent applications after 1980 patent law changes, 50 profits from government-funded research, 17 relations with industry, 7, 50, 54, 61-62, 119

University of Alabama project on availability of tissues for research, 53-54 University of California, Los Angeles Medical Center cell line development, 25-26 University of California, San Diego development and ownership of Hagiwara hybridoma, 26 University of Minnesota Hospital "Liver Tissue Procurement and Distribution System," 53 Waiver of consent requirements Federal regulations, 95 Waiver of patient's and research subjects' rights Federal regulations, 107, 110-111 fee-for-service research, 62 removal of ban in Department of Health and Human Services regulations, 18 University of California, Los Angeles-Moore ownership case, 26 warranties) implied blood and semen sales, 76-77 West, W.H. foundation of Biotherapeutics, Inc., 62 White blood cells. See Lymphocytes WI-38 normal human cells development and ownership, 25



"The Far Side" cartoon panel is reprinted by permission of Chronical Features, San Francisco